

List No. 11

Northenden Ward	Application Number 084471/FO/2007/S2	Date of Appln 9th Oct 2007	Committee Date 13th Mar 2008
Proposal	Erection of 2 storey dwelling to side of No. 9 Queenhill Road and erection of single storey extension to rear of No. 9 Queenhill Road		
Location	9 Queenhill Road, Northenden, Manchester, M22 4HW		
Applicant	John Clarke, 21 Boat Lane, Manchester, M22 4HR		
Agent			

Description

Members will recall that this application was previously heard at the Planning and Highways Committee meeting of 14th February 2008 where Members deferred for a site visit.

This application was previously put before Members of the Wythenshawe Area Committee at its meeting of 24th January 2008, where Members recommended the application be refused on the basis that the proposal would be an over development of the site, would create visual disamenity and would have a detrimental impact upon the nearby conservation area.

This application relates to a north west facing end terrace property with a substantial garden to the side measuring 7.15 metres to the side boundary. It is proposed to erect a single storey extension to the rear of the property, and to erect a two storey dwelling house to the side. The two storey dwelling to the side would attach directly to the existing house at no. 9 Queenhill Road, thus making that a mid-terrace property and the new dwelling being the end terrace house.

The proposed two storey dwelling has been designed to be in keeping with the existing terrace and has similar proportions to that. No. 9 Queenhill Road has a frontage of 5.5 metres in width and the proposed dwelling would have a frontage of 5.7 metres in width. The proposed dwelling would leave a gap to the side boundary of 1.4 metres.

A previous owner of No.9 Queenhill Road received planning permission in March 2003 for a two storey side extension to the property.

Consultations

Local Residents - 2 letters of objection have been received for this application. The comments can be summarised as follows:

- i) The proposal could have the potential to seriously compromise the character and upset the balance of the road, which consists of 12 artisan terrace houses in two blocks of 6, circa 1902, opposite 10 terrace houses circa 1938 in two blocks of 5 with several mixed Victorian houses at the Mill Lane end. Currently the houses are evenly proportioned and this proposal would alter this.
- ii) The proposal does not appear to fall into the category of social housing, but into that of individual entrepreneurship.

List No. 11

iii) Although Queenhill Road is not within the village conservation area, it is bordered on 3 sides by the area and therefore should, I feel, be considered in this context.

iv) The level of activity involved in building both and extension and a house on what is a small street, within a local one way system could have the potential to be extremely disruptive for a considerable time.

v) Parking is already difficult on this narrow road; many houses have 2 cars and as there are only 4 of the terraced houses which have off road parking and as this proposal will remove one of them, this could increase the on road parking by up to 4 cars.

vi) The erection of another dwelling in the garden of No. 9, will drastically alter the outlook from No. 22 and have an impact on the quality and quantity of light.

vii) Has no objection to the erection of a single storey building to the rear of No. 9, but firmly opposes the proposal for a new dwelling to be built directly opposite No. 22.

Northenden Civic Society - Do not object to the proposed extension but do object to the proposed erection of a house on the grounds that the scheme will be an overdevelopment of the site and is contrary to the UDP.

Greater Manchester Police Architectural Liaison Officer - Have no objections to the proposed development.

Head of Landscape Practice - We understand that a tree has already been removed within the site. In accordance with the aims of the Guide to Development (2007) to increase tree cover within the city, we would recommend that the applicant is required to plant 1no. tree per plot. Trees should be heavy standards at 12-14cms girth. Conclusion - In summary, we support this application subject to our recommendations.

Head of Regulatory and Enforcement Services - No objection in principle of this application.

Head of Environmental and Operations Technical Services - A tree, a mature Prunus has been removed. Replacement not specified.

Environment Agency - Has no objection in principle to the proposed development and no comment to make.

Issues

The Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester (1995) - The application site is unallocated within the UDP. However, when dealing with applications of this nature, regard is given to policies H1.2, H2.2, H2.7, and E3.5 contained within part one of the UDP. In addition, Development Control Policies Number 7 "New Housing Development" is also applicable.

Policies contained in Part 1 of the UDP, which are applicable to new housing developments, are as follows:

List No. 11

Policy H1.2 states that the City Council will ensure that the housing stock contains a wide range of housing types to meet the needs of people who want to live in Manchester. The above should include accommodation designed for disabled people.

Policy H2.2 is also relevant and states that the City Council will not allow development that will have an unacceptable impact on residential areas. The matters which the Council will take into consideration include the scale and appearance of the development and its impact in terms of noise, vibration traffic generation, road safety and air pollution.

Design is also an important factor in the determination of planning applications. Indeed, policy H2.7 outlines how new housing schemes will be expected to be of a high standard of design and to make a positive contribution towards improving the City's environment.

Policy E3.5 wishes to promote measures which will lead to a safer environment for all people living in and using the City. These measures will include:

- a) Ensuring that the layout of new development is designed with safety in mind and does not lead to the creation of isolated areas;
- b) Designing landscaping schemes so as to minimise the risk of attack

Policies contained in part 2 which are applicable are as follows:

Policy DC7 states that the Council will negotiate with developers to ensure that new housing is accessible at ground level, including those who use wheelchairs, wherever this is practicable.

Regional Spatial Strategy for the North West (RSS) - Formerly RPG13- provides planning guidance for the North West Region. Since 2004, the RSS has formed part of the statutory development plan as such the weight to be attached to its policies has increased.

Policy DP2 seeks to ensure that there is an enhancement in the overall quality of life experienced in the region. In particular, the provision of a high quality of life for this and future generations is encouraged.

Policy DP3 states that new development must demonstrate good design quality and respect for its setting.

The North West Plan (draft Regional Spatial Strategy) - Publicised in January 2006 - provides the future planning framework for the physical development of the region over the next 15 to 20 years.

Policy DP1 seeks to ensure quality in new development. Proposals and schemes must demonstrate excellent design quality, sustainable construction efficiency in resource use and respect for their physical and natural setting.

Other Relevant Policies and Guidance - In considering development proposals, reference is not only made to the UDP, but also other policies and supplementary planning guidance. In this case, these include PPS1, PPS3, Wythenshawe Strategic Regeneration Framework, and "A Guide to Development in Manchester Supplementary Planning Document and Planning Guidance (Adopted April 2007)".

List No. 11

PPS1 sets the overarching planning policies on the delivery of sustainable development through the planning system. In terms of design, the document states: -

"Planning Authorities should plan positively for the achievement of high quality design and inclusive design for all development, including individual buildings, public and private spaces and wider area development schemes. Good design should contribute positively to making places better for people. Design which is inappropriate in its context, or which fails to take opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area and the way it functions, should not be accepted"

PPS3 states that residential environments should be about creating places, streets and spaces which meet the needs of people, are visually attractive, safe, accessible, functional, inclusive, have their own distinctive identity and maintain and improve local character.

In addition, proposal must also be well-connected to facilities and public transport. Proposals must also be integrated with, and complements, the neighbouring buildings (Para 16).

Policies contained within the Wythenshawe Strategic Framework relate specifically to realising the vision for Wythenshawe which seeks to build upon the areas status as a 'Garden City'. In particular, build upon the uniqueness and the opportunities present in the area by bringing together the positive aspects of its housing and the continued growth of the economy.

Policy H2 seeks to improve, maintain and manage the Wythenshawe housing stock.

Policy H4 seeks to improve the built form through better design and mix of properties, in particular, address the quality, condition and function of neighbourhoods.

The Guide to Development in Manchester Supplementary Planning Guidance (Adopted April 2007) outlines the City Councils objectives for creating a more attractive, accessible and useable City for Manchester People.

The guidance clearly states that a high quality environment is created by buildings which reflect their purpose and respect the place in which they are located. Each new development should therefore recognise the uniqueness of individual areas of the City and these characteristics should be built upon by new developments by having full regard to its context and the character of the area.

Principle - There is currently a large garden to the side of no.9 Queenhill Road, which is in a primarily residential area. In addition, the application site is in close proximity to Northenden District Centre where there are a range of amenities such as shops and restaurants and public transport services. As such, the application site is considered to be in a highly sustainable location as prescribed by PPS3.

List No. 11

In summary, it is considered that the proposal is acceptable, in principle, as it conforms to the objectives of PPS3 and will provide a family house which are in much demand in this part of south Manchester.

Consideration has, however, to be given as to whether the design and appearance of the proposal is acceptable, scale and mass, impact on residential amenity and car parking/traffic implications.

Design and Appearance - The proposal has been designed to similar proportions to that of no. 9 Queenhill Road, and the rest of the terrace, with fenestration detailing to match. In determining whether the design of a proposal is acceptable, both PPS3 and Policy H2.7 of the UDP are applicable. The policies state that high quality of design must be achieved so that it enhances an area.

The proposed dwelling will be two-storey in height. The design features of the other properties in the street have informed the design of the proposal, such as, the rectangular windows and hipped roof. This will assist in maintaining the appearance of the street scene.

The materials proposed are to match the existing terrace and have been conditioned to ensure that they are approved prior to the commencement of the development, which will enable a choice of brick and materials to be appropriate to the street scene.

Scale and Massing - The proposal is two storeys in height. It fits neatly within the gap between no.s 9 and 11 Queenhill Road, with a remaining gap of 1.4 metres to the side boundary. As such, it is not considered to be excessively large or bulky for the plot of land. In addition, the proposal will not be higher than the roof height of no. 9 Queenhill Road, which ensures that a form of regularity is achieved in the appearance.

Residential Amenity - Objections have been received from surrounding properties that are concerned about the impact of the proposal on the visual amenity of the street scene and the fact that the proposal would compromise the character and upset the balance of the number of terraced houses.

The proposal is not considered to have a negative impact on the visual amenity or character of the area due to the prevalence of terrace properties along the street.

In addition, concern has been raised regarding the impact, of the building, on the properties opposite the proposal in terms of loss of light. It is considered that the proposal may effect a loss of light to some of the properties across the road from the proposal site for a brief period of time in the morning, but this is not considered sufficient to warrant the withholding of planning permission.

Traffic and Highways Issues - Objections have been received in respect of the contribution the scheme will make to on street car parking and congestion in the area. Whilst it is noted that Queenhill Road suffers from particular problems, it is not considered that one additional dwelling together with the loss of the existing parking space will have a sufficiently detrimental impact to justify refusal. The application is situated in a highly sustainable location near the heart of Northenden District Centre, which enables facilities to be walking distance from the proposed property.

List No. 11

Trees - The Head of Landscape Practice has suggested replacement tree planting at a ratio of 1 per plot. This is not shown on plan, however, a suitable condition can be placed on the application to require appropriate planting.

In summary, the proposal provides the opportunity to create a new family home in a highly sustainable location, which will not detract from the character of the area as the proposal has been designed as such that the appearance and design of the proposal will blend in with the common features of the street scene.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations – This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the approval of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of approval and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and country Planning Acts.

Recommendation APPROVE

on the basis that the proposal is in accord with the City Council's Unitary Development Plan in particular policies H1.2, H2.2, H2.7, E3.5 and DC7 is of good design and will provide a family house in a sustainable location without significant impacts on the amenities of adjoining occupiers and there are no material considerations of sufficient weight to indicate otherwise.

Wythenshawe Area Committee - Refuse on the basis that the proposal would be an over development of the site, would create visual disamenity within the street scene, and would have a detrimental impact upon the character of the conservation area.

Conditions and/or Reasons

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings and documents unless otherwise agreed in writing by the

List No. 11

City Council as Local Planning Authority: drawings not numbered but stamped as received 9th October 2007

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans. Pursuant to policy H1.2, H2.2, H2.7, E3.5 and DC7 of the Manchester Unitary Development Plan.

3) No development that is hereby approved shall commence unless and until samples and specifications of all materials to be used on all external elevations of the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The development shall be constructed only using the approved materials unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - To ensure that the appearance of the development is acceptable to the City Council as local planning authority in the interests of the visual amenity of the area within which the site is located, as specified in policy H1.2, H2.2, H2.7, E3.5 and DC7 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

4) Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of, and Classes (A-H) of Part 1 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Development Order) 1995 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no garages, extensions (including enlargement and alteration to the roof) shall be erected other than those expressly authorised by this permission.

Reason

In the interests of residential amenity pursuant to policy H2.2 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester (Adopted 1995).

5) No development shall commence until a scheme for the storage (including segregated waste recycling) and disposal of refuse shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The details of the approved scheme shall be implemented as part of the development and shall remain in situ whilst the use or development is in operation.

Reason - In the interests of residential amenity pursuant to policy H2.2 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester (Adopted 1995).

6) No works or development shall take place until full details of proposed replacement tree planting, and the proposed times of planting, have been approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and all tree planting shall be carried out in accordance with those details and at those times.

Reason: To ensure adequate and appropriate tree planting and the retention of such planting pursuant to policy H2.2 of the adopted UDP for the City of Manchester.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

The documents referred to in the course of this report are either contained in the file(s) relating to application ref: 084471/FO/2007/S2 held by planning or are

List No. 11

City Council planning policies, the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, national planning guidance documents, or relevant decisions on other applications or appeals, copies of which are held by the Planning Division.

The following residents, businesses and other third parties in the area were consulted/notified on the application:

Environment Agency
Chief Executive's Landscape Practice Group
Environmental Health
Environment & Operations (Trees)
Greater Manchester Police
Northenden Civic Society
10 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
12 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
14 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
16 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
18 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
20 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
22 Govan Street, Manchester, M22 4HA
1 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
18 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
20 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
22 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
24 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
26 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
28 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
3 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
5 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
7 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
9 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW

Representations were received from the following third parties:

Carolyn Macdonald, 22 Queenhill Road, Manchester, M22 4HW
Personal details withheld at the request of individual
Personal details withheld at the request of individual

Relevant Contact Officer : Melanie Tann
Telephone number : 0161 234 4538
Email : m.tann@manchester.gov.uk