

| | | | |
|-------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| List No. 1 | | | |
| Crumpsall | Application Number | Date of Appln | Committee Date |
| Ward | 084863/FO/2007/N1 | 24th Jan 2008 | 13 th March 2008 |

| | |
|------------------|--|
| Proposal | Proposed erection of 16 no. three storey town houses with new access road off Wilton Road and associated car parking and landscaping, following demolition of existing buildings |
| Location | Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Crumpsall, Manchester, M8 4NG |
| Applicant | Wainhomes (North West) Ltd, C/o Agent |
| Agent | Mr P Sedgewick 24 Queensbrook, Spa Road, Bolton, BL1 4AY |

Description

This application relates to a large detached house that is vacant and boarded up with a large outhouse building to the side set well within a substantial sized garden. It is situated on the north side of Wilton Road and covers 0.3 hectares. The existing house is set approximately 40 m to back of the road and 20 m away from the nearest neighbouring property and is orientated with the front of the house facing in a southwest direction. It is an irregular shaped site with the garden area extending to the rear of nos 23 –27 Wilton Road. The existing vehicular access is next to a bungalow (no 39 Wilton Road). The land at the front is generally level , however, the land to the north of the site slopes steeply away from the boundary down to the properties on Bowker Bank Avenue.

The surrounding area is residential in nature comprising two storey semi-detached houses, detached houses and bungalows. There is a block of flats at the end of Bowker Bank Avenue situated to the north east of the site.

The proposed layout takes the form of a cul de-sac. A new road will be formed toward the centre of the site with a pair of three storey houses on one side and a terrace of three storey houses with integral garages on the other facing Wilton Road following the building line formed by nos 27 –39 Wilton Road. A short “T” turning arrangement will be created at the back of these houses where eleven houses are to be erected with hard surfaced front gardens set back between 8m, and 20 metres from the turning area.

An outline application for the erection of 16 flats on the site was refused in August 1993 (ref 042381/oonorth1/92) on grounds of overdevelopment, inadequate amenity space, introduction of additional traffic to a backland area, incongruous nature in relation to character of area and because of its scale and form. A subsequent appeal was dismissed.

Consultations

Local Residents Fourteen letters of objection have been received form local residents with twelve letters from residents on Wilton Road and two on Bowker Bank Avenue.

The grounds of objection are as follows:-

16 houses are far too many for this piece of land, it would be better to retain Holland House as it is a piece of Crumpsall history, and it is sad to see it neglected, gardens ruined and many established trees at rear of the site felled.

List No. 1

Wilton Road is a residential street of detached and semi-detached properties and building on this land should follow this pattern. The access seems limited and may be difficult for emergency vehicles to access. It will lead to an increase in traffic on Wilton Road. It is feared that dustbins would be left on Wilton Road on collection days. The proposed dwellings are not in keeping with Crumpsall's neighbourhood which consists of semi-detached houses and bungalows rather than three storey buildings proposed. The three storey houses would result in overlooking and loss of light. The 16 houses would significantly increase traffic on Wilton Road which is restricted to one way with no entry from Middleton Road. The extra traffic will be hazardous to children and wheelchair users.

One resident on Wilton Road is concerned that one of the houses will be only 8 metres away from kitchen window and will reduce light to windows and put their garden into shade and obliterate views that they presently enjoy.

It is considered that the number of cars will increase the pollution and fumes in the area making it less environmentally friendly, it is accepted that improvement is needed and would welcome fewer houses that are not as tall. The felling of trees has reduced visual outlook and privacy, the Manchester Plan opposes cul de sac type developments in favour of continuing the street scene and the proposal is therefore contrary to this policy. The development would take away one of the few remaining green plots in Crumpsall and involve loss of wildlife habitat. Holland House should be converted into luxury flats with landscaped gardens. It is noted that the desk top contamination study recommended additional studies on land stability to the northern and eastern boundaries. The sewers were not designed to accommodate additional volume of waste.

The new plans show more building and higher density than previous plans that were refused and hope that these plans will also be refused. It is considered that only bungalows would be appropriate for this site.

Two residents on Bowker Bank Avenue have raised issues concerning loss of privacy due to this road being at a lower level and lack of light due to three storey being proposed. It also considered that the new house will increase noise levels and affect quality of life as well as affect property value.

Ward Councillors. Cllr R Leese wishes to object to this application in the strongest terms, it has nothing whatsoever to commend it. The application has no respect for environment or location and is nothing more than an attempt to cram as many poorly designed houses on to one plot of land as possible.

The proposals are not in keeping within the existing built form on Wilton Road which consists mainly of older semi-detached dwellings or newer bungalows and two-storey houses with substantial boundary walls. By contrast this proposal appears to have all parking front of property in clear conflict with the guide to development and is a device to try and cram more properties in. The front of properties appears to be largely open plan with no clear divisions either between properties or to share pedestrian and vehicle areas. The proposed properties are built very close to the backs of existing properties' gardens leading to both overlooking and to severe visual disamenity, not least given that these are intended to be three storey properties. Even if all the layout issues themselves were satisfactory, the property elevations themselves are mediocre and out of keeping with their surroundings. This is an appalling proposal and it hoped that it is rejected.

List No. 1

Greater Manchester Ecology Unit. The bat survey has been carried out by a licensed and experienced bat consultant. The survey found no evidence of bats on the day of survey and considered the site not to have a high potential to support bat roost. Should planning permission be granted it recommended that the following conditions are attached.

1. Prior to the demolition works the attic of the barn/garage should be inspected internally by a licensed bat consultant.
2. The ridge tiles on all buildings should be removed by hand and the exposed areas checked for signs of bats, under supervision of the bat consultant.
3. Opportunities for biodiversity should be taken, since the surrounding area is suitable for foraging bats, use of locally native species in any landscape scheme and provision of bat roost tubes in the new buildings.

Head of Regulatory Services Pollution Control has recommended that a condition requiring the residential accommodation to include acoustic glazing and acoustically treated ventilation in accordance with an acoustic attenuation scheme to be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council. Also a condition requiring details for refuse storage space for segregated waste for collection and recycling to be submitted for approval by the City Council.

Landscape Practice A tree survey is required and trees to be retained should be protected in accordance with BS 5837:2005. There is scope to include more tree planting as part of the landscaping scheme. Removal of the hedge will result in the development being more exposed. The proposed trees are too small and should be replaced with larger trees of at least 12-14 cm girth. A five year maintenance plan is required. It is recommended that a variety of shrubs with more contrast in growing height is planted rather than all low growing shrub planting. Hard landscape details should be submitted to show site boundaries, details of surfacing and an approach to sustainable drainage.

It is concluded that the development proposes to introduce a much more intense building density than the existing layout. This will have a considerable impact on the surrounding landscape particularly as most existing vegetation is being lost and the removal of the evergreen hedge will be particularly significant. The proposed buildings are also higher than existing and nearer to the boundary which again increases their visual impact. The orientation of the building line with the existing buildings on this street also increase their visual impact particularly those on the other side of Wilton Road. It is recommended that the number of building plots on the site is reduced to enable it to be better screened and assimilated into the landscape. It is also recommended that the building height is reduced so that it is in line with the existing properties of Wilton Road. Greater consideration should be given to the planting proposal for this scheme in order to help reduce the significant visual impact this development will have on the landscape.

North Manchester Partnership. Can be summarised as follows: no objections to redevelopment for housing given this is an established residential area however, they are concerned about the scale of the proposal in terms of the number of units that would be developed on the site.

The proposed properties fronting onto Wilton Road (plots 15,16 and 1,2 and 3) should be comparative to the surrounding street and be more in keeping with the existing street scene. Beyond the immediate frontage and given the topography of the site there is more scope for three storey town housing and requests that fewer units overall be allowed. The existing layout shows no

List No. 1

amenity space for housing that will clearly attract families and my view would be that if no communal space is provided then decent sized gardens should be provided within the housing plots. The house types are inappropriate at this location.

Overall this proposal seeks to maximise the number of units and this has a detrimental impact on the layout and design which impacts on existing housing and I would suggest that we seek a more modest development taking on board some of my suggestions. The strategy for North Manchester is to reinforce and promote the area as a residential area however we need to ensure that we promote and encourage quality developments and my view would be that this application falls well below what we should be expecting in an existing residential area.

Head of Engineering any comments will be reported to Committee

Greater Manchester Police any comments will be reported to Committee.

Issues

Unitary Development Plan - As the site is situated within Crumpsall, Area policy CC1 applies. Policy CC1 states,

In deciding its attitude to proposals within Cheetham and Crumpsall, the Council will have regard to the general policies in Part 1 of the Plan in order to:-

- a. improve housing of all types and avoid the need for future widescale clearance;
- b. provide infill and redevelopment sites for new housing;
- c. discourage overdevelopment and overintensive use of residential land and buildings and so as to avoid congestion in housing units and their surroundings;
- d. reduce the problems caused by vacant and derelict land and buildings by encouraging redevelopment, especially of smaller sites where shape and location would discourage proper maintenance for open space;
- e. concentrate the provision of public open space into suitable areas close to where people live;
- f. provide a network of green routes for pedestrians and cyclist between different parts of the area;
- g. create a safer environment and allow for greater sense of personal safety, especially children and the elderly;
- h. encourage and promote enterprise skills which exist especially in Strangeways and Cheetham because of their contribution to the City's economic health;
- i. provide for improvements to public transport and reduce congestion in areas such as Strangeways and Cheetham district centre;
- j. ensure a balanced distribution and wide accessible shopping facilities to meet the needs of all sections of the community.

Other relevant policies in this case specifically relate to housing, the environment and transport, as follows.

List No. 1

Policy DC7 states that the Council will negotiate with developers to ensure that new housing is accessible at ground level to disabled people, including those who use wheelchairs, wherever practicable.

Policy DC7a.1 states the redevelopment of large buildings of local historic/architectural interest in extensive grounds will only be permitted where there is no loss of visual character and amenity value, nor the visual quality and interest of the local area.

Policy H1.2 states that the City Council will ensure that the housing stock contains a wide range of housing types to meet the needs of people who want to live in Manchester. The above should include accommodation designed for disabled people. The City Council also encourages environmental improvements to make residential areas safer and more attractive though Policy H2.1.

Policy H2.2 states that the Council will not allow development, which will have an unacceptable impact on residential areas. The matters that the Council will consider will include the scale and appearance of the development and its impact in terms of noise, vibration, traffic generation, road safety and air pollution.

Policy H2.7 outlines how new housing schemes will be expected to be of a high standard of design and to make a positive contribution towards improving the City's environment. Areas of incidental space should not be formed unless arrangements are made for their proper and enduring maintenance.

Policy E3.5 states the Council will promote measures which will lead to a safer environment for all people living in and using the City. These measures will include :-

- ensuring that the layout of new development is designed with safety in mind and does not lead to the creation of isolated areas;
- designing landscaping schemes so as to minimise the risk of attack;
- that community facilities are located where they are safe to get to;
- providing safe places for children to play;
- improving road safety.

Policy T2.4 states that the City Council will expect developments to make adequate provision for their car parking requirements. In deciding whether the level of car parking associated with any development is acceptable, the Council will have regard to the environmental capacity of the site both in terms of the physical appearance of the car parking and its effect on neighbouring activities and also the ability of the local road network to accommodate the traffic generated by the proposed development.

Policy T2.6 explains how the Council expects an adequate car parking provision to be made for disabled people, and T3.1 states that the Council will ensure that the particular needs of both pedestrians and cyclists are catered for in new development schemes.

The Guide to Development in Manchester Supplementary Planning Document and Planning Guidance provides a framework for all development in the City. This document offers design advice and sets out the City Council's aspirations and vision for future development and contains core principles to guide developers to produce high quality and inclusive design. The principles that development should seek to achieve, include, character and context, continuity,

List No. 1

and enclosure, ease of movement, quality of the public realm, diversity, legibility and adaptability. The document discourages the use of cul de-sacs
As they impose unnecessary constraints on permeability and can aggravate antisocial behaviour and crime.

National Planning Policy Guidance - Planning Policy Statement 1 (PPS1): Delivering Sustainable Development, advises that planning should facilitate and promote sustainable and inclusive patterns of urban development by making suitable land available for development in line with economic, social and environmental objectives to improve people's quality of life, contributing to sustainable economic development, protecting and enhancing the natural and historic environment, ensuring high quality development through good and inclusive design and efficient use of resources, and ensuring development supports existing communities and contributes to the creation of safe, sustainable, liveable mixed communities with good access to jobs and key services for all members of the community.

Planning Policy Statement 3 (PPS3): Housing, in deciding Planning Applications, local planning authorities should have regard to achieving high quality housing, ensuring developments achieve a good mix of housing reflecting the accommodation requirements of specific groups, in particular families and older people, the suitability of a site for housing including its environmental sustainability, and using land effectively and efficiently, and ensuring the proposed development is in line with planning for housing objectives, reflecting the need and demand for housing in an area.

Regional Planning Guidance - RPG13 - policy DP1 advises that economy in the use of land and buildings is required. New development and other investment in infrastructure and services should be located so as to make the most effective use of land, promote appropriate mixes of uses within a site and its wider neighbourhood, make efficient use of transport facilities and assist people to meet their needs locally. Policy DP3 advises that new development must demonstrate good quality design and respect for its setting.

Draft Regional Spatial Strategy - DP1 states, proposals and schemes must demonstrate excellent design quality, sustainable construction, efficiency in resource use and respect for their physical and natural setting.

Planning considerations

Principle – Holland House has some local historic interest and is set in extensive grounds. The proposal to demolish it and develop the whole of the site in the manner shown would undoubtedly have a seriously detrimental impact on the visual amenity and character of the area and would be contrary to policy DC7a.1. The proposed density is 53 dwellings per hectare slightly exceeds the national guidelines maximum density for residential development in this type of location. Six of the houses have particularly small areas of private garden area. It is considered that the built form of the proposal taking into account, its scale and massing with a cul de sac layout arrangement involving extensive areas of hard landscape is inappropriate in this location. It would have an adverse impact on the character of the surrounding area and involves the loss of the open spacious quality of the garden to Holland House that currently gives a strong contribution to the visual amenities enjoyed in this part of Crumpsall.

List No. 1

Visual impact / Character of Area The majority of the houses will be three storeys in height and these will be out of character with the area and do not take into account the context and are inappropriately design not informed by the surrounding area. This will be particularly the case for the houses facing Wilton Road as they will create a strident and incongruous feature in the street scene and will have a very poor visual relationship with numbers 27 and 39 Wilton Road leaving only a small gap between the new houses and the two storey house and adjacent bungalow.

Privacy/ impact on Neighbouring Properties. The proposed orientation of the houses on the site has been selected to minimise problems of overlooking to existing houses. There will be a distance of 12 m from rear of no 27 Wilton Road to gable of the terrace of three house immediately to the back of their garden and meets Council guidelines. The "L" shaped two storey semis that are positioned close to the northeast boundary, in similar location to the existing outbuilding, will face directly north , however, the distance between these and 34-40 Bowker Bank Avenue is 15 m but they are not directly facing, however, because of the difference in levels this will accentuate the problem as well as creating a visually dominant feature when viewed from this block of flats.

A new house is also to be built close to the boundary on the eastern side of the site next to the rear garden of number 39 Wilton Road. This new house has three garages on ground floor, with two to be allocated to adjacent houses, with a two bedroom apartment above. The windows at first floor would directly overlook the rear garden of no 39 Wilton Road and a building in this position would have a poor physical relationship having an unduly dominant impact on number 39 Wilton Road.

Refuse storage. Bin storage areas are shown to side and rear gardens with a bin collection area shown in the "T" turning area. An access route to enable occupiers of the central property to rear of 25 Wilton Road, to move their refuse to the collection point, without moving receptacles through their house is indicated on the plans.

Disabled Access - The applicant have said that the development will be laid out to meet Part M Requirements of the building regulations. The highway within the site that is to be adopted will be designed to meet Council's adoption standards.

Secured by Design - Greater Manchester Police Architectural Liaison views are awaited and this will be reported further at Committee.

Traffic and car parking – The proposal will involve a small increase in traffic movements in the area. The views of Head of Engineering are awaited and this matter will be reported further to Committee.

Sustainability – A Code for Sustainable Homes Planning Pre- Assessment has been carried out and it is concluded that that the development should achieve a level 3 Rating.

Landscaping and trees – the proposal will involve loss of the landscape garden which has amenity/ visual value for the area and the replacement scheme is not of high quality. It is considered that the proposal would have an unduly detrimental impact on the landscape character of this part of Crumpsall.

Conclusion

List No. 1

This is a poor quality submission in terms of its built form, scale, massing, poor layout, with a high density that would be out of character with the surrounding area and have a detrimental impact upon the levels of visual amenity currently enjoyed in the vicinity of the site in addition it would have an unduly dominant impact on numbers 27, 39 Wilton Road and 34-40 Bowker Bank Avenue, and it is therefore recommended for refusal

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations – This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the refusal of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of refusal and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation REFUSE

Conditions and/or Reasons

1. The proposed development, by reason of its built form, scale, poor layout, high density and massing of the proposed houses, involving the loss of open aspect and garden space would have a detrimental impact upon the levels of visual amenity currently enjoyed in the vicinity of the site and on the street scene and character of this part of Crumpsall contrary to policy CC1c, H2.7, H2.2 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, the Guide to Development in Manchester Supplementary Planning Document and Planning Guidance adopted in April 2007, and national guidance contained in PPS1 and PPS3.
2. The proposed three storey high houses will be out of character with the area and do not take into account the context of the surrounding area and is an inappropriate form of design that is not informed by the local character, creating strident and incongruous features in the street scene on Wilton Road that will in addition have a very poor visual relationship with numbers 27 and 39 Wilton Road, contrary to the Guide to Development in Manchester Supplementary Planning Document and Planning Guidance, policies H2.2, H2.7 of the Unitary Development Plan and national guidance contained in PPS1 and PPS3.
3. The proposal to demolish Holland House and develop the whole of the site in the proposed manner shown would have a seriously detrimental impact on the visual amenity and character of the area and would be

List No. 1

contrary to policy DC7a.1., H2.2 and H2.7 of the Unitary Development plan for the City of Manchester.

4. The proposal involving the erection of two buildings on the eastern side of the site close to the boundary will result in loss of privacy to 39 Wilton Road and numbers 34-40 Bowker Bank Road and will have a poor physical relationship with these properties and will have an over dominant impact on the residential amenities enjoyed by the occupiers contrary to policy H2.2 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

The documents referred to in the course of this report are either contained in the file(s) relating to application ref: 084863/FO/2007/N1 held by planning or are City Council planning policies, the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, national planning guidance documents, or relevant decisions on other applications or appeals, copies of which are held by the Planning Division.

The following residents, businesses and other third parties in the area were consulted/notified on the application:

Chief Executive's Landscape Practice Group
Environmental Health
North Manchester Regeneration Team
Greater Manchester Police
Greater Manchester Ecology Unit
Engineering Services
23 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
25 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
18 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
20 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
22 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
24 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
26 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
28 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
30 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
32 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
34 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
36 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
38 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
40 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
42 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
44 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
46 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
48 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
50 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
52 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LF
Flat 1, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
Flat 2, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
27 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
12 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
14 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
16 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
18 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
20 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ

List No. 1

22 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
24 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
26 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
28 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
15 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
17 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
19 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
21 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
23 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
25 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
1 Mountford Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LN
2 Mountford Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LN
3 Mountford Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LN
4 Mountford Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LN
15 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
17 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
19 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
21 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
Flat 4, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
Flat 5, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
Flat 3, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
Flat 6, Holland House, 33 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
39 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
41 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
45 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4NG
10 Wilton Road, Manchester, M8 4WQ
1 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
3 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
5 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
7 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
9 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL
11 Bowker Bank Avenue, Manchester, M8 4LL

Representations were received from the following third parties:

Mr & Mrs P Ryder, 30, Bowker Bank Ave, Crumpsall, Manchester.
Jodie McCarthy, 23 Wilton Rd, Crumpsall, Manchester
Occupiers 27, 25, 26, 24, 18, 22, 20, 65, 9, 42, Wilton Road
Occupier 2 Bowker Bank Avenue

Cllr R Leese.
Greater Manchester Ecology Unit.
Landscape Practice
Head of Regulatory Services.

Relevant Contact Officer : David Hughes
Telephone number : 0161 234 4272
Email : d.hughes3@manchester.gov.uk