

Application Number	Date of Appln	Committee Date	Ward
087175/LO/2008/N2	1st Aug 2008	23rd Oct 2008	Ardwick Ward

Proposal LISTED BUILDING APPLICATION for works involving internal and external alteration and restoration works in association with change of use of buildings to form accommodation connected to educational /community use and exhibition space, commercial offices and residential accommodation

Location Mrs Gaskells House, 84 Plymouth Grove, Ardwick, Manchester, M13 9LW,

Applicant Manchester Historic Buildings Trust, Mrs Janet Allan, 10 Dale Road, New Mills, High Peak, SK22 4NW

Agent Bernard Taylor Partnership Limited Elizabeth House, 486 Didsbury Road, Heaton Mersey, Stockport, Cheshire , SK4 3BS

Description

The application site is the subject of planning application: 087175/LO/2008/N2, which deals with the use of the building in connection with educational /community use and exhibition space, commercial offices and residential accommodation. This application deals specifically with external and internal restoration and refurbishment works affecting the fabric of the listed building and alterations associated with the proposed use of the building.

There are two other associated applications on this agenda, namely: are:

087173/FO/2008/N2 - Formation of a new car park and associated bin store with creation of new vehicular access off Plymouth Grove
Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove

087174/FO/2008/N2 - Change of use of premises to form accommodation for community groups, educational activities, exhibitions and office space in connection with the activities of the Manchester Historic Buildings Trust with offices to let on the first floor, conversion of the coach house to residential accommodation for caretaker and external site alterations including reconfiguration of car parking area and landscaping.

Mrs Gaskell's House is a 2-storey, Victorian Villa with basement and attic accommodation. The site is affected by changing ground levels as it runs from east to west. A residential apartment block (1960's) is situated to the west of the site at 82 Plymouth Grove (Cranford Court) with a play area to the east of the site. A Victorian Villa, which has been converted into flats, is situated to the south of the site at 2-4 Swinton Grove.

The proposed works involve:

- a. Externally
 - i. Extensive roof and parapet repairs
 - ii. Reconstruction of chimney stacks with stone cappings.

- iii. Reintroduction of chimney over stable block.
 - iv. Repair of mouldings, render and pilasters.
 - v. Reinstatement of missing missing architraves.
 - vi. Generally paint stripping, re-pointing and elevational refurbishment.
 - vii. Redecoration of render walls.
 - viii. Reform front steps in natural stone.
 - ix. Repair / reset stone steps to rear
 - x. Repair and reinstatement of boundary walls and railings.
 - xi. Construction of new wall along the boundary wall with Cranford Court.
 - xii. Reinstatement / refurbishment of stone cappings and other details.
 - xiii. Addition of security bars to light well.
- b. Internally
- i. "Like for like" replacement / repair of all windows to principal elevations.
 - ii. Reinstatement of door and surrounds on west elevation on ground floor.
 - iii. Stripping out works to address dry rot with the building
 - iv. Floor Strengthening at ground and first floor;
 - v. Strip out redundant recent fittings and partitions.
 - vi. Remove first floor ceilings and reinstate original ceiling heights.
 - vii. Reinstatement window fanlight over main stair at first ceiling level.

Alterations to the building include:

- a. Internally
- i. A new passenger lift between basement and ground floor levels on the west side for disabled access and circulation purposes.
 - ii. A new stable block and platform lift to full height of stable block.
 - iii. Raise level of basement floor by 1 step to ease ramp gradient to basement.
 - iv. New WC arrangements to basement.
 - v. Alterations to vaulted cellar to accommodate new lift and kitchen.
 - vi. Inclusion of lobby and WC facilities.
- b. Externally
- i. Introduced ramped access to ground floor on west elevation with storage areas beneath.
 - ii. Introduction of handrail to new front steps.
 - iii. Tunnel beneath stable block to be in-filled and new windows introduced on north and south elevations.
 - iv. Ramped carriage drive raise to improve access via steps and ramp.
 - v. New bound gravel drive introduced from Swinton Grove.

The setting of the listed building is affected by the formation of front and rear car parking areas and landscaping.

Consultations

Local Residents - No comments received.

Manchester Conservation Areas and Historic Building Panel - The Panel was generally supportive of the proposal and the re-use of the listed building. However, it was noted that the delivery of the proposed scheme was dependent upon the acquisition of funds. The Panel felt that a "development restriction" should be placed upon any approval to prevent the creation of the surface car park on the adjacent site until funding for Mrs Gaskell's House had been secured. The lack of visitor car parking for the scheme was questioned, but did not feel that additional car parking should be provided within the site.

Any trees lost within the site should be replaced within a landscaping scheme comprising "semi-mature, in-character" replacements.

The proposed disabled access was questioned. The access ramp does not appear to have a continuous handrail and the provision of such features may add to visual clutter and adversely affect the visual appearance of the listed building. Further consideration should be given to these arrangements with the view to accommodating more sensitive alterations to the side entrance to accommodate the lift at grade and reduce ramp heights and lengths and the need for guardrails. A request was made for the consideration of a modern lift solution, which would reduce the extent of intervention onto the fabric of the building. However, the reliability of such a "technological" solution was noted.

Greater Manchester Archaeological Unit - No objections to the proposals.

South Manchester Regeneration - Express support for the proposals.
English Heritage (NW Region) - Actively support the proposals.

Issues

Unitary Development Plan - The following policy is relevant.

DC19.1 - In determining applications for listed building consent or planning applications for development involving or having an impact on buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest, the Council will have regard to the desirability of securing the retention, restoration, maintenance and continued use of such buildings and to protecting their general setting. In giving effect to this policy, the Council will:

- a. not grant Listed building consent for the demolition of a listed building other than in the most exceptional circumstances, and in any case, not unless it is satisfied that every possible effort has been made to continue the present use or to find a suitable alternative use;
- b. not permit a change of use of a listed building, where it would have a detrimental effect on the character or appearance of the building;
- c. not permit any external or internal alteration or addition to a Listed building where, in its opinion, there would be an adverse effect on its architectural or historic character;
- d. seek to preserve and enhance the settings of listed buildings by appropriate control over the design of new development in their vicinity, control over the use of adjacent land, and where appropriate, by the preservation of trees and landscape features;

- e. permit demolition only where there are approved detailed plans for redevelopment and where there is evidence of a firm building contract;
- f. not permit alterations to a listed building which would prevent the future use of any part of the building, in particular upper floors or basements, or where poor maintenance is likely to result.

Guide to Development in Manchester 2: Supplementary Planning Document and Planning Guidance- The Guide aims to support and enhance the on going shaping of the City by providing a set of reasoned principles which will guide developers, designers and residents to the sort of development we all want to see in Manchester.

Of particular relevance:

2.54 - Encourages the retention of buildings to accommodate new uses, particularly where they contribute to the character and appearance of an area and reinforce its sense of place. Accommodation accessibility is also emphasised.

Planning Policy Guidance 15: Planning and the historic environment - Provides a full statement of Government policies for the identification and protection of historic buildings, conservation areas, and other elements of the historic environment.

Principle of the works and alterations to the listed building - The mix of uses to be undertaken within the building are addressed under application 087174/FO/2008/N2, which is elsewhere on the agenda. However, it is considered that there are benefits to be accrued from the provision of active and sustainable uses for the listed building, thereby securing its long term maintenance and retention.

Impact on the listed building - The applicants have sought to restore, reinstate and refurbish the external elevations and associated detailing. The works will thereby bring the exterior of the building back into good order and address its decline. It is considered that the external works will not only maintain the character of the building but lead to the reinstatement of important original features and detailing.

Internally, the proposed works are required to allow the building to function in contemporary context, which is capable of supporting the proposed range of uses. The approach taken by the applicants is considered to be both sensitive and practical. Partition walls to be removed as part of the proposals are considered to be acceptable, as they represent interventions to the building, which relate to the previous use of the building and diminish from its character. The impact of the proposed disabled access arrangements is discussed separately.

It is considered that the application has been supported by satisfactory documentation, which will be related to the development by condition. It is considered that these details will allow the sensitive and authentic restoration of the buildings and thereby address the concerns of the Manchester Conservation Areas and Historic Building Panel.

Disabled Access - In response to the comments of the Manchester Conservation Areas and Historic Building Panel, it is considered that the proposed disabled access arrangements are necessary and appropriate. It is the case that mechanical solutions have been provided to the office use and between the lower and upper ground floors. However, it is considered that the reliance on a mechanical system regarding its reliability and the inclusivity of access to the building.

The proposed access ramp provides direct entry into the main exhibition areas without adversely affect the appearance of the main portico forming the entrance to the building. The main impact of the access ramp is to the western elevation This impact on the appearance of the building is reduced by the proximity of adjoining outbuildings and the use of period handrails and balustrades. The applicant has been made aware of these concerns and a condition has been attached to the associated planning permission (087174/FO/2008/N2) ensure that this issue is satisfactorily addressed prior commencement of the use.

Setting of the listed building - The spaces around have essentially been retained. The vehicular access points from Plymouth Grove are as existing thereby securing the established relationship between the building and the street scene. The presentation of the building to Plymouth Grove is further improved by the introduction of formal landscaping. The introduction of the western boundary wall, adjacent to Cranford Court, will give the site definition and improve its setting. The car parking area to the rear of the site has some impact, which may be mitigated against through the introduction of additional landscaping. By locating the required car parking to the rear of the building the most important elevations to the building retain a positive and unobstructed visual relationship with Plymouth Grove and Swinton Grove.

Conclusion - It is considered that the submitted scheme secures the sympathetic and effect restoration of the building. Suitably balanced external and internal interventions to the building give the building to allow it to function in a modern context thereby securing active and sustainable uses, which are compatible with relevant UDP and Supplementary Development Policies as well as PPG15.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations – This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the approval of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of

approval and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation APPROVE

Conditions and/or Reasons

1) The works to which this consent relates must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this consent.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as applied and modified in relation to buildings in conservation areas.

2) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings and documents unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as Local Planning Authority: 2124-01(A); 2124-02; 2124-03; 2124-04; 2124-05; 2124-06; 2124-7; 2124-08; 2124-09; 2124-10; 2124-11C; 2124-12B; 2124-13B; 2124-14B; 2124-15; 2124-16; 2124-17; 2124-18; 2124-19; 2124-20A; 2124-21A; 1903-01; Design and Access Statement dated 10th July 2008 as amended by document dated 29th July 2008; Conservation Management Plan: 84 Plymouth Grove Parts 1 and 2 (AHP) on 14th July 2008.

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans. Pursuant to policies H2.2 and DC19 of the Manchester Unitary Development Plan and PPG15.

3) Before the works hereby granted by this listed buildings consent are commenced plans and particulars of the soft stripout of the parts of the listed building which are currently obscured by suspended ceilings and partitions or internal cladding and detailing how any damage thereto is to be mitigated shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The approved plans and particulars shall be implemented as part of the development and the soft stripout shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans and particulars.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with DC Policy 19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

4) Before the development commences a schedule for the refurbishment/repair of the existing roof, including details of any replacement roof covering, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The scheme shall provide for the retention of the existing roofing materials. Any replacement roof covering shall be agreed in writing by the City Council as Local Planning Authority

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special

Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

5) Before the building is first occupied the external brickwork of the building shall be cleaned in accordance with plans and particulars previously approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - To improve the appearance of the building in the interests of visual amenity and because proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and in accordance with Policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

6) No rainwater goods nor pipes shall be installed nor affixed other than rainwater goods and pipes constructed of cast iron and shall be treated in a colour to be agreed in writing by City Council as local planning authority prior to the commencement of refurbishment and restoration works. All such goods shall be kept in the approved colour black unless agreed in writing.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

7) No works, including repair to existing windows shall commence until details of the work has been submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. Such works should not include for the removal or replacement of any original windows unless otherwise approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority and any such proposal shall be accompanied by a full justification for such works, including a structural survey, details of why repair and refurbishment of such windows is not viable and details, including materials and cross sections, of any proposed replacement windows.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

The documents referred to in the course of this report are either contained in the file(s) relating to application ref: 087175/LO/2008/N2 held by planning or are City Council planning policies, the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, national planning guidance documents, or relevant decisions on other applications or appeals, copies of which are held by the Planning Division.

The following residents, businesses and other third parties in the area were consulted/notified on the application:

South Manchester Regeneration

English Heritage (NW Region)

1 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
1 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
2 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
2 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
3 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
3 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
4 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
4 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
5 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
5 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
6 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
6 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
7 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
7 Radlett Walk, Manchester, M13 9EE
8 Dulford Walk, Manchester, M13 9EF
84 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 1, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 1, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 10, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 10, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 11, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 11, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 12, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 12, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 13, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 14, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 14, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 15, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 15, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 16, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 16, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 17, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 18, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 19, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 2, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 2, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 20, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 3, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 3, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 4, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 4, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 5, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 5, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 6, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 6, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 7, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 7, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 8, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU

Flat 8, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW
Flat 9, 2-4, Swinton Grove, Manchester, M13 0EU
Flat 9, Cranford Court, 82 Plymouth Grove, Manchester, M13 9LW

Representations were received from the following third parties:

South Manchester Regeneration
English Heritage (NW Region)

Relevant Contact Officer : Carl Glennon
Telephone number : 0161 234 4530
Email : c.glennon@manchester.gov.uk