

Application Number	Date of Appln	Committee Date	Ward
088747/LO/2009/S1	12th Jan 2009	12th Mar 2009	Whalley Range Ward

Proposal LISTED BUILDING CONSENT internal remodelling of north wing to form residential accommodation for 81 overseas students and managers flat, erection of an entrance tower incorporating lift, access ramp to courtyard, alterations to window openings to form emergency escape doors and re mould external fire escape stairs

Location Hartley Hall, Alexandra Road South, Whalley Range, Manchester, M16 8NH,

Applicant Manchester Islamic School Trust , Hartley Hall, Alexandra Road South, Whalley Range, Manchester, M16 8NH,

Agent Thomas Worthington Design, Brook House, 1 Brook Road, Cheadle, Cheshire, SK8 1PQ

Description

This application for Listed Building Consent relates to Hartly Hall a grade II Listed Building located on the west side of Alexandra Road South at its Junction with Brantingham Road. Originally built as a Methodist college, the building was used by the Royal Northern College of Music until 1990 when the building was purchased by the Manchester Islamic Schools Trust, since when it has operated as the KD Grammar School. The building comprises a main block fronting Alexandra Road South and is largely brick with terracotta and stone dressings, to the rear are a number of large wings, which are much less ornate being finished in common brick with engineering brick detailing.

This application relates to the currently unused northern wing which fronts Brantingham Road. The wing which is three storeys high was original built as dormitory accommodation and comprises small single bedrooms off a corridor. Shared washing facilities were provided in two towers attached to the corners of the wing. The wing itself is built around three side of a landscaped courtyard. Between the wing and Brantingham Road are seven mature trees a small group of saplings, a belt of high dense shrub and a lawn. The boundary to Brantingham Road is a 1.5 metre high brick wall.

It is proposed to bring the accommodation within the wing back into use as living accommodation principally for overseas students undertaking further education in the Manchester Area. To this end there would be no access between the wing and its parking area and the KD Grammar School. Internally the basic pattern of the rooms will remain unchanged, though a pod would be inserted into each bedroom to provide en-suite facilities. Whilst the accommodation is predominantly in single bedrooms, there would be six twin rooms and three where two rooms are amalgamated to form fully accessible accommodation. In addition there would be a managers flat on the ground floor together with a reception

area and visitors toilets. Shared kitchens and dining rooms would be provided on each floor, whilst the existing towers would accommodate lounges and laundry facilities. Much of the historic fabric of the main structure remains, fixtures and fittings have over the years been replaced. The proposed structural alterations are designed to have the least impact possible on the historic fabric of the building.

Amenity space would be provided in the central courtyard and a new free standing, access including a ramp would be provided.

Currently access into the wing is through the main school building. As part of the proposal to separate the proposed use from the school it is proposed to create a new access on the Brantingham Road frontage. This would take the form of a freestanding contemporary styled tower containing stairs and a lift with a glazed link to the main building. As submitted the tower would be a mixture of glass and rainscreen cladding with a zinc clad butterfly roof. A new pedestrian and vehicular access would be formed from Brantingham Road and this would lead to an 8 space car parking area. A storage area is proposed for bicycles and a travel plan has been provided. No trees are lost to the development though a length of shrubbery will be lost to the new access.

An existing metal fire escape is to be removed.

An application for Planning Permission for the works the subject of this application can be found elsewhere on this agenda, ref 088746/FO/2009/S1. The proposed development has been advertised on site and in the press.

Consultations

Local residents - Eleven letters have been received objecting to the proposed development a further nine letters were received objecting to the planning application which accompanies this application. The comments of the residents is summarized below.

1. The proposed changes are too radical for a building of such historic heritage. And will undermine the very reason for it being Listed.
2. The proposed entrance tower uses materials that have no relationship to the original building.
3. The proposal is an overdevelopment of the site. Originally students resident on the site had the freedom of all the extensive grounds. New students will only have limited access to amenity space. Part of the original grounds have been developed with Hartley Hall Gardens.
4. Not all the rooms are fully accessible.
5. There are not enough parking facilities.
6. Communal facilities, which will be the noisiest directly overlook Hartley Hall Gardens.

7. Should permission be granted the following conditions should be met, double glazing, enforcement of noise regulations late at night, more parking facilities within the grounds, double yellow lines on Brantingham Road, possibly reducing the numbers of rooms, relocating the communal rooms elsewhere in the development.

8. The accommodation was originally for students of the college. This proposal is a purely commercial venture to provide more student accommodation in an already saturated market.

9. No fencing is shown on the plans segregating the school from the student accommodation.

10. No accommodation is provided for guests

Historic Buildings and Conservation Areas Panel - The panel were excited at the prospect of bringing the north wing back into use for its original purpose. Concern was expressed about the design of the proposed entrance and it was suggested that it could either be redesigned or relocated within the courtyard with a new access created through the existing building.

Issues

Unitary Development Plan - the relevant policy is DC19 which seeks to ensure that developments affecting Listed Buildings do not detract from their historic character.

Regional Spatial strategy - The RSS was adopted as part of the development plan for the City of Manchester in September 2008. The relevant policies are:-

DP2 - Which seeks to promote sustainable communities

DP3 - Which supports the promotion of sustainable economic development

DP4 - Which looks to make the best use of existing resources and infrastructure

DP6 - Which seeks for development to marry opportunity and need.

DP7 - Requires new developments to promote environmental quality.

L1 - schemes including education should ensure that there is provision for all members of the community

EM1 (C) - New schemes should protect, conserve and enhance the historic environment.

Principle - This application relates solely to the impact the proposed development will have on the Listed Building. Issues relating to impact on the amenity of surrounding residents are dealt with in the planning application.

Buildings Listed as being of Architectural or Historic Interest are an important part of Manchester's heritage. The best way of ensuring their survival for future generations is to keep them in active use. This development seeks to bring back into use the residential accommodation that has been unused since the Islamic High Schools Trust took over the building in 1990. The principle of bringing the building back into use is therefore to be welcomed all the more so as the proposed use is similar to the original purpose for which this wing of the building was constructed.

Internal works - The internal layout has been designed in such a fashion as to minimise the amount of intrusive works required. Where rooms are linked rather than remove a wall only a door is created, thus when two rooms are joined to make an accessible room the bathroom is overlarge occupying the whole of one of the rooms. Only fixtures and fittings added during Royal Northern College's tenure are being removed. It is not proposed to add double or secondary glazing to the windows. Waste will be removed using existing pipework. The head of planning believes that the proposed internal works have been sensitively planned in a manner that will cause least harm to the historic fabric of the building.

Proposed entrance tower - The design of the proposed entrance tower and in particular the materials has caused a great deal of concern. Trying to replicate the appearance and material of a listed building when seeking to construct an extension seldom works well and it is accepted practice that a contemporary solution which clearly distinguishes the historic building from the new is the most satisfactory way forward. However, the proposed tower in this case occupies an extremely prominent position and it is considered that the position, its elaborate design in particular the roof and the use of rainscreen cladding will result in an over intrusive feature that will detract from the Listed Building. Negotiations have taken place with the applicant and it is proposed to simplify the proposed entrance feature by replacing the rainscreen with glass so that the whole structure will be glazed, and a flat roof to replace that originally proposed. The Head of planning believes that such an approach will reduce the impact of the development making the extension subservient to the Listed Building.

Two alternatives were suggested. The Historic Buildings And Conservation Panel suggested placing the tower within the courtyard, this would intrude significantly into the amenity space and necessitate significant alterations to the historic fabric of the building in creating an entrance and associate ramps. The second alternative proposed by a resident involved using one of the existing towers to accommodate the lift and stairs, these towers are however too small and the works would result in the loss of a significant amount of historic fabric. By locating the tower towards the rear of the building it reduces the impact of the structure on

the Chapel which is both architecturally and historically more interesting than the rather plainer and simpler elevations of the north wing.

External Works -The sympathetic design and careful choice of materials will ensure that the works to the grounds have minimal impact on the setting of the Listed Building.

Conclusion -Subject to the redesign of the proposed entrance tower the proposed works are sympathetic to the character of the Listed Building and will enable it to have a productive future, which will ensure its long term survival.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations - This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the approval of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of approval and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Human Rights Act 1998 considerations – This application needs to be considered against the provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998. Under Article 6, the applicants (and those third parties, including local residents, who have made representations) have the right to a fair hearing and to this end the Committee must give full consideration to their comments.

Protocol 1 Article 1, and Article 8 where appropriate, confer(s) a right of respect for a person's home, other land and business assets. In taking account of all material considerations, including Council policy as set out in the Unitary Development Plan, the Head of Planning has concluded that some rights conferred by these articles on the applicant(s)/objector(s)/resident(s) and other occupiers and owners of nearby land that might be affected may be interfered with but that that interference is in accordance with the law and justified by being in the public interest and on the basis of the planning merits of the development proposal. He believes that any restriction on these rights posed by the approval of the application is proportionate to the wider benefits of

approval and that such a decision falls within the margin of discretion afforded to the Council under the Town and Country Planning Acts.

Recommendation MINDED TO APPROVE

(Subject to the submission of revised elevations for the proposed entrance tower.)

On the basis that the proposal is in accord with the City Council's Unitary Development Plan in particular policy DC19 which seeks to protect buildings listed as being of architectural or historic interest from inappropriate development and there are no material considerations of sufficient weight to indicate otherwise.

Conditions and/or Reasons

1) The development must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this permission.

Reason - Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2) No development that is hereby approved shall commence unless and until samples and specifications of all materials to be used on all external elevations of the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The development shall be constructed only using the approved materials unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - To ensure that the appearance of the development is acceptable to the City Council as local planning authority in the interests of the visual amenity of the area within which the site is located, as specified in policy DC19 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

3) The development hereby approved shall be carried out in accordance with the following drawings and documents unless otherwise agreed in writing by the City Council as Local Planning Authority: ** ******

Reason - To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans. Pursuant to policy ** of the Manchester Unitary Development Plan.**

4) Before the works hereby granted by this listed buildings consent are commenced plans and particulars of the soft stripout of the parts of the listed building which are currently obscured by suspended ceilings and partitions or internal cladding and detailing how any damage thereto is to be mitigated shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The approved plans and particulars shall be implemented as part of the development and the soft stripout shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans and particulars.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with DC Policy 19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

5) Before the development commences a schedule for the refurbishment/repair of the existing roof, including details of any replacement roof covering, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority. The scheme shall provide for the retention of the existing roofing materials. Any replacement roof covering shall be agreed in writing by the City Council as Local Planning Authority

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity, and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest so careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policy ** of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.**

6) Before the building is first occupied the external brickwork of the building shall be cleaned in accordance with plans and particulars previously approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - To improve the appearance of the building in the interests of visual amenity and because proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building and in accordance with Policy DC19.1 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

7) No rainwater goods nor pipes shall be installed nor affixed other than rainwater goods and pipes constructed of cast iron and coloured black. All such goods shall kept coloured black unless agreed otherwise by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity and because the proposed works affect a building which is included in the Statutory List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historic Interest and careful attention to building work is required to protect the character and appearance of this building in accordance with policy ** of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.**

8) Before development commences, a full photographic record of the site and the building (internally and externally) including all areas where physical changes are proposed, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the City Council as local planning authority.

Reason - To provide a record of any archaeological remains and of the listed building's appearance and condition before works commence, in accordance with Policy DC20 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

The documents referred to in the course of this report are either contained in the file(s) relating to application ref: 088747/LO/2009/S1 held by planning or are City Council planning policies, the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester, national planning guidance documents, or relevant decisions on other applications or appeals, copies of which are held by the Planning Division.

The following residents, businesses and other third parties in the area were consulted/notified on the application:

Whalley Range Forum

49, 66 to 78 Alexandra Road South,
Flats 1 to 3, 35 Manley Road,
23 to 33 Manley Road,
Flats 1 to 6, 31 Manley Road,
49, 55 to 59 Alness Road,
43 Manley Road, Manchester, M16 8HN
Flats 1 to 4, 41 Manley Road,
13 to 19, 17a, 37, 39 Manley Road,
Flats 1 to 17, 21 Manley Road,
Flats 1 to 8, 21a, Manley Road,
Flats 1 to 8, Alexandra Mews, 64 Alexandra Road South,
1 to 21, 2 to 20 Woodacre,
Flats 1 to 12, Brantingham Court, Alexandra Road South,
43a, 43 to 61 to 69, 54 to 60, 62, 62a to 62e, 64, 68 to 74 Brantingham Road,
Flats 1 to 6, 31 Alexandra Road South,
41, 43, 51 to 63, 65 to 77, 80 to 92 Alexandra Road South,
Church Of The English Martyrs, Alexandra Road South,
English Martyrs Parish Centre, Alexandra Road South,
38 Springbridge Road,
1 to 41 Hartley Hall Gardens Gowan Road,
20 to 24 Waltham Road,
Mariana House, 45-47, Alexandra Road South,
2 to 16 Gildridge Road,
1 to 23, 2 to 16 Waltham Road,
40 Springbridge Road,
16 to 21, 18 to 24 Gildridge Road,
1, 3 Arnold Road,
1 to 13 Gowan Road,
Flats 1 to 6, 8 Arnold Road,
2 to 16, 7 Arnold Road
Flats 1 to 6, 6 Arnold Road,
90a, Alexandra Road South
Russley Lodge Residential Home, 276 Wilbraham Road,
Flats 1 to 12, Arnold Court, 278 Wilbraham Road

**270 to 274, 284 to 288 Wilbraham Road,
1a to 1c, Highbury Road,
3, 5 Highbury Road,
Flats 1 to 9, 51-53, Alness Road
1 to 33 Holden Avenue
Flats 1 to 10, Grosvenor House, 280 Wilbraham Road
1 to 8, 1a, 1b Arundale Avenue
Flats 1 to 10, Arundale Court, 282 Wilbraham Road**

Representations were received from the following third parties:

**10 Arnold Road
62c, 62e Brantingham Road,
11, 14, 30, 39 Hartley Hall Gardens,
11 Woodacre,**

**Relevant Contact Officer : Dave Morris
Telephone number : 0161 234 4539
Email : d.morris@manchester.gov.uk**